



601 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Suite 900, South Building
Washington, D.C. 20004-2601
Tel: 202-220-3172
Toll-Free: 1-866-360-7197
Email: nrlnmessage@msn.com
Website: <http://www.NRLN.org>

Board of Directors:

Bill Kadereit, President
Robert Tompkins, VP – Secretary/Treasurer
Robert Foresta, VP – Legislative Affairs
Bob Martina, VP – Grassroots Network
Jane Banfield
Will Buergey
John Christie
Joseph R. (Dick) Ciocca
Chris Dyrda
Chuck Gilbert
Ralph Maly
Mary Ann Neuman
Judy Stenberg
Ray Sternot

Washington & Support Staff

Executive Director: Marta Bascom
Legislative Strategist: Michael Calabrese
VP - Communications: Ed Beltram
Webmaster: Joe Sciuilli

NRLN is a coalition of 30 Retiree Associations advocating the rights of more than 2 million American retirees from...

Aetna / Agilent / American Airlines / Ameritech/SBC / AMF / American Mutual / Amica Mutual / AT&T / Avaya / Avin Meritor / Ball Aerospace / Baltimore Public Schools / Bell Atlantic / Bell Helicopter / Bendix / BOC Group / Boeing / California State Employees / Caterpillar / C & P Telephone / Chrysler / College of New Rochelle / Colorado DOT / Commonwealth Edison / Continental General Tire / Datatronics / Delphi / Delta Air Lines / Dept. of Justice / Detroit Edison / Detroit Diesel / Diamond State / DTE Energy / Eastman Chemical Co. / Embarq / Enco Alloys / Entergy Operations, Inc. / Exelon / FedEx / Fidelity / Fisher Scientific Co. / Ford / General Electric / General Motors/ General Telephone / Gulf Oil / Hoechst Celanese / Holophane / Honeywell Vorr / Hughes Aircraft / HWB / IBM / IBEW / Illinois Bell / Indiana Bell / J. I. Case Corp. / John Deere / Johns Manville / Johnson & Johnson / Kaman Corp. / Kansas City Schools / Kodak / Lockheed Martin / Lucent Technologies / Marlboro / McDonnell Douglas / MCI / MetLife / Mich Con / Michigan Public Schools / Mobil Oil / Monsanto/Solutia / MST&T Co. / NASD / Net Co. / Nevada Bell / Niagara Mohawk Power / North Memorial Medical Center / NSTAR / Northwestern Bell / Ohio Bell / PacBell / PECO Energy / Pension Actuary / Pfizer / Phila Electric Co. / Polaroid / Portland GE-Enron / Prudential / Public Service of Colorado / Raytheon / Rock-Tenn Co. / Rocky Mount Mills / Rohm & Haas. Co. / Rouse Co./ Salis / Southern New England Tel / Southwestern Bell / Spherion Corp. / Springs Mills / Sprint / Telesector Resources Group / Texas Instruments / Transamerica / UCLA / Ullico / United Airlines / University of California / UPS / U.S. Air Force / U.S. Airways / U.S. Bureau of Reclamation / U.S. Marine Corp. / U.S. Navy / USAF Trucking / US West-Qwest / USPS / Verizon / Visteon / Wells Fargo / Western Union / Weverhaeuser /

September 22, 2010

Mr. Joshua Gotbaum, Director
Pension Benefit Guaranty Corporation
1200 K Street NW
Washington, DC 20005-4026

Dear Director Gotbaum:

I am writing to thank you for the time and effort that your staff put forth to meet with National Retiree Legislative Network (NRLN) members on September 15th and the time you took to speak with us as well. We were especially pleased to hear that you might welcome statutory and rule changes that would make the PBGC's job easier and, we would hope, more equitable for retirees. The NRLN pledges to work with your staff wherever we can to achieve both of these objectives.

I want to particularly express the NRLN's appreciation for the work of Michael Rae, Amy Wiener and Mark Ness. Michael worked with NRLN Executive Director Marta Bascom to arrange for the meeting and he kept the dialogue between NRLN members and your staff focused throughout the meeting. Ms. Wiener and Mr. Ness made insightful presentations on how the PBGC process works after taking over a pension plan. It was helpful to the retiree association leaders to understand in more detail what goes into the PBGC's calculation of payments to retirees.

The NRLN looks forward to continue working with your highly knowledgeable staff to advance the equitable treatment of retirees when a pension plan defaults to the PBGC.

Thank you very much for your dedication and that of your staff. We greatly appreciate it.

Sincerely,

Bill Kadereit, President
National Retiree Legislative Network

Attachment:



Pension Guarantees that Work for Retirees

A Proposal for Commonsense PBGC Reforms

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The current economic downturn has highlighted just how vulnerable America's workers and retirees are to the threat of corporate bankruptcy and the dumping of company pension obligations onto the government's pension guarantee system. The Pension Benefit Guaranty Corporation (PBGC) took over 129 terminated plans during 2009, a 75% increase from the year before. The pace of plan terminations has only accelerated since then.

As required by ERISA, plan sponsors pay a per-participant "insurance premium" to the PBGC – a cost paid from plan assets. Although these premium payments may not reflect the long-term cost of insuring the benefits, retirees are led to believe their benefits are protected, at least up to the statutory maximum (currently \$54,000 per year for a 65-year-old, but lower under age 65). Unfortunately, workers and retirees learn only after plan termination that a number of PBGC practices can leave them with benefits that are permanently reduced by 30 percent or more.

Arbitrary gaps in ERISA's benefit guarantee program are imposing unanticipated and devastating losses on tens of thousands of retirees and older workers forced into retirement by the bankruptcy of their employer. Benefits actually paid by the PBGC can be much lower than the vested benefits earned. Some limitations on PBGC's guarantee are imposed specifically by ERISA – such as the maximum annual benefit guarantee (which varies based on age). This paper focuses on one statutory and two *discretionary* policies that PBGC maintains despite the fact that it leads to unexpected and unfair benefit losses for a large number of older workers and retirees.

First, while ERISA imposes limitations on benefit guarantees, ***the largest loss of earned benefits suffered by most retirees after a plan termination is caused by the PBGC's decision to value the future cost of benefits using an unrealistically low interest rate assumption.*** The lower the interest rate, the greater the estimated present value of future benefit obligations. But while other qualified pension plans are required, pursuant to the Pension Protection Act of 2006, to calculate their funded status based on the AA corporate bond yield curve prescribed by the Treasury Department, the PBGC uses a much lower discount rate (currently under 5%) that is derived from the prices charged by private insurance companies for fixed and deferred annuities.

The government is confusing and misleading 44 million insured plan participants by requiring companies to send them year after year an Annual Funding Notice that discloses a funding level and projected benefit obligation that are substantially rosier than what the PBGC later calculates as "termination liability." In other words, the PBGC chooses to use a different – and far more conservative – interest rate assumption in valuing benefit obligations than a plan sponsor is required to use under ERISA's minimum funding rules. And because

(More)

National Retiree Legislative Network (NRLN) Terms of Use: This entire document is protected by U.S. copyright laws. It may not be altered or used for any commercial purpose without the written consent of the NRLN. It may be displayed, copied and distributed for non commercial purposes providing you clearly attribute use of any part or all of it to the NRLN.

the PBGC assumes a much lower discount rate on future benefit obligations (recently under 5%), it allocates plan assets *as if* it will not be offsetting a substantial portion of future benefit costs by investing the plan assets, just as other plan sponsors offset future costs with expected market rates of return on investment.

As a result, the assets recovered from a terminated plan cover the inflated “present value” of guaranteed and non-guaranteed benefit obligations to a much lesser degree than if the PBGC assumed that plan assets would earn a long-term average market rate of return (typically 6% to 8%). Because the present value of benefit liabilities are exaggerated, plan assets rarely cover even most of the non-guaranteed vested benefits, such as benefit increases within five years of termination. This results in unnecessarily large and permanent losses for participants. **Congress should require PBGC to use the same corporate bond yield curve and other assumptions as plan sponsors for the purpose of allocating plan assets to pay non-guaranteed benefits.**

The second discretionary PBGC policy that unnecessarily reduces benefits for a subset of retirees is flatly contrary to the plain language of ERISA. One of the statutory limitations on guaranteed benefits is the five-year phase-in of “any increase in the amount of benefits under a plan *resulting from a plan amendment.*” If such a benefit increase becomes effective within one year of the plan termination date, it is not guaranteed at all; if the amendment made the benefit increase effective more than one year prior to termination, the guarantee phases in 20% per year.

Despite the statutory definition of the five-year phase-in as “resulting from a plan amendment,” the PBGC has determined that the annual statutory inflation adjustment of the maximum annual compensation that can be considered in calculating a benefit (the IRC Section 401(a)(17) limit) and the maximum annual benefit payable by a qualified plan (the IRC Section 415(b)(1)(A) limit) is a benefit increase subject to the five-year phase in. As a result, older workers or retirees whose accrued monthly benefit simply adjusted automatically in line with the statutory inflation adjustment suffer a disproportionate loss of benefits. Although vested, these benefits are rarely paid because the portion not guaranteed under the five-year phase-in is moved to a low Priority Category (PC-5), at which point there are rarely plan assets remaining to pay these “non-guaranteed” claims. **The PBGC should change this policy or Congress should clarify that a benefit increase triggered by a federal statute is not subject to the five-year phase-in limitation.**

A third indefensible gap in ERISA’s guarantee system is the statutory three-year ‘lookback’ that PBGC applies to determine what benefits are eligible for payment under Priority Category 3. On the date of plan termination (or bankruptcy filing, whichever is earlier), if a plan participant has not been retired (in “pay status”) or eligible to retire for at least three years, then no portion of his or her benefit is eligible for PC-3 prioritization. The guaranteed portion of the benefit will still be paid (under PC-4), but the *non-guaranteed* portion will almost always be unfunded and lost forever. Since all of the non-guaranteed benefits of recent retirees are demoted to PC-5, this group takes a big reduction whether they have been retired for 1 month or nearly three years. **Congress should amend Section 4044(a)(3) so that the benefits of all plan participants who are already retired, or eligible to retire, on the date of plan termination are protected equally.**

Finally, the paper addresses the growing concern about the PBGC’s ability to deter plan terminations by, or recover assets from, foreign-owned or foreign-based plan sponsors. Actually collecting on a liability in practice requires that foreign entities have sufficient assets within the jurisdiction of U.S. courts. Because of this increased risk, PBGC should add foreign ownership, and proposed sales or spin-offs to foreign owners, to the list of transactions triggering an Advance Notice of Reportable Events, as well as special scrutiny under the PBGC’s Early Warning Program. In addition, **Congress should clarify that the PBGC has the authority to enforce a lien against all U.S.-based assets of a foreign plan sponsor and require that plan fiduciaries – particularly a plan’s “named fiduciary” – be U.S. citizens subject to the jurisdiction of U.S. courts.**

For a full copy of this whitepaper, contact Marta Bascom at 703-863-9611 or marta.bascom@linkspace.net